

The Effect of Teaching Strategies on Students' Self-Esteem

Shamsher Khan¹, Sidra Kiran^{*2}, Muhammad Moin³

¹MPhil Scholar, Department of Education, ALHAMD Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

^{2*} Assistant Professor, Department of Education, ALHAMD Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

³Head of Education Department, Dar-UI-Madina International University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Corresponding author: sidra.kiran@aiu.edu.pk

Keywords: Teaching strategy, Self-Esteem, Effective Teaching

DOI No:

<https://doi.org/10.56976/rjsi.v6i2.253>

This study investigated the effect of teaching strategies on students' self-esteem across various domains, including general, social, marital, and academic contexts. The research focused on 10th-grade students in Murree Tehsil, employing a sample of 300 students (150 boys, 150 girls) and 120 teachers. A self-developed instrument for teaching strategies and the Coopersmith Self-Esteem Inventory were used to measure self-esteem with gender differences. Results indicated that teaching strategies significantly predict students' self-esteem, with all variable pairs showing significant effects ($p < 0.01$). A t -test revealed significant gender-based differences in the relationship between teaching strategies and self-esteem ($t = -1.341, p = 0.00$). The study emphasizes the importance of positive reinforcement and constructive teacher feedback to enhance students' self-esteem. These findings contribute to understanding how teaching methods can be optimized to support students' self-esteem development across various life domains, offering practical implications for educators and policymakers in designing effective teaching approaches.

1. Introduction

Self-esteem is the belief in one's worth or capacity. It encompasses one's beliefs about oneself and many emotional states, such as pride, embarrassment, despair, and victory (Warner, 2021). Teaching strategies encompass teachers' various ways, approaches, procedures, and processes to instruct students. There is a consensus that instructional strategies have various aspects, and their effectiveness is influenced by the specific context in which they are employed (Dignath & Veenman, 2021). The effectiveness of modern teaching methods may positively impact students' self-esteem, which is vital for career choices and professional growth.

The efficacy of teaching is contingent upon implementing system-wide policies that effectively engage in teachers' recruitment, preparation, support, management, training, and motivation. Several countries, including Finland, Japan, and Singapore, proudly showcase a system characterized by the presence of highly competent educators. In several diverse countries, educational methodologies exhibit either insufficiency or lack of internal coherence (Pritchett, 2022). The selection process for educators involved in planning projects may require a certain level of selectivity, and the minimum qualifications for educators in this field may be comparatively lower than those in other professions. The effective performance of an educator may not necessarily be recognized or rewarded. Recruiting or advancing educators may be influenced by political factors or patronage. Educators who lack sufficient training and preparation may be expected to demonstrate a remarkable educational curriculum despite their limited proficiency (Gándara, 2022; Tulley & Chiu, 1995).

Envision an educational establishment wherein teaching is regarded as a calling rather than a profession. The role of teachers in a student's education and American culture has undergone a major transformation. Teaching methods diverge from conventional "shared time" drills, but contemporary healthcare approaches, such as using bloodsuckers and leeches, deviate from established practices. The primary purpose of the guidance is not to deliver lectures to students seated in rows at desks, attentively listening and jotting down notes (Loughlin & Lindberg-Sand, 2023). On the contrary, it provides each child with an individualized, comprehensive, and fulfilling avenue for growth. The learning environment encompasses not only the confines of the classroom but also extends to the domestic sphere, the local community, and the global context. Information is ubiquitously digitally accessible, represented by bits and bytes, and is not exclusively confined to traditional printed sources.

The notion of self-esteem is a remarkable construct employed to elucidate individuals' trajectory in their pursuit of happiness. Joubert's definition of self-esteem characterizes it as the subjective evaluation of one's overall self-worth, which arises from an implicit appraisal of self-approval or self-disapproval conducted by the individual. Dolan (2021) argues that self-esteem encompasses an individual's internal evaluation of their aptitude to effectively engage in all aspects of life, including employment, living, and personal growth, as a fully developed individual. Ultimately, this phenomenon arises from the viewpoint that individual accomplishments in material, geographical, and ethical domains are contingent upon one's endeavors and the trust that scientists place in their abilities as well as in the capabilities of their peers. Self-esteem is

contingent upon an individual's capacity to engage in activities such as dreaming, self-care, critical thinking, and generating productive problem-solving strategies, regardless of the circumstances encountered in life. These soft skills like critical thinking have been focused on today's teaching and learning in national and international contexts concerning policy, practice, and teachers' perspective (Fung, 2014; Holmes et al., 2015; Jamil, 2021; Jamil, Bokhari, & Ahmad, 2024; Jamil, Bokhari, & Rafiq, 2024; Jamil et al., 2021)

According to Rosenberg (1965), a correlation exists between an individual's self-worth and self-esteem. Additionally, self-worth may be classified into two distinct categories: universal and clear. Self-esteem pertains to an individual's evaluation of their worth and value inside a particular context. In contrast, international self-esteem encompasses an individual's assessment of their self-worth across diverse contexts. Given its comprehensive evaluation of an individual's positive and negative elements, global self-esteem provides a more precise and comprehensive assessment.

The current study investigates the effect of instructional methodologies on students' self-esteem. Through the implementation of this research, we can acquire valuable knowledge regarding the impact of various instructional methods, approaches, and strategies on students' self-esteem. The results of this study can have tangible consequences for educators, schools, and educational policymakers. Suppose specific pedagogical approaches are determined to have a beneficial influence on students' welfare and self-worth. In that case, they can be integrated into educational methodologies to establish a friendly and nurturing learning setting, resulting in enhanced academic achievement and comprehensive growth. The present study will also be advantageous for educators in implementing suggested tactics that might augment kids' self-esteem across various domains, including overall self-perception, social relationships with peers, familial environment, and academic performance in school.

2. Literature Review

Several studies have focused on the teaching approach and its effects on students' self-esteem. Self-esteem is an individual's estimated self-worth, and esteem (Rosenberg, 1965) significantly predicts students' academic achievement, peer interactions, and psychological well-being. Several researchers have also positively correlated teachers' interaction with students with self-esteem. Of the more than 800 studies analyzed by Hattie (2009), teacher-student relationships were found to have an effect size of 0.72 on student achievement, which indirectly impacts self-esteem. Based on this, Koca (2016) conducted a study with middle school learners and discovered that teachers' positive and encouraging communication influences learners' self-esteem and academic motivation.

Other student-centered teaching practices have also been reported to positively affect self-esteem. For instance, cooperative learning strategies have been linked with increased student self-esteem. A meta-analysis of 177 studies conducted by Johnson et al. (2008) found that students who participated in cooperative learning activities had higher self-esteem than those who competed or worked independently. Likewise, Slavin (2015) observed that collaborative learning environments created a positive view among students regarding belonging and competence, promoting self-esteem.

Modifying content delivery in line with the learners' needs has also been associated with positive impacts on self-esteem. Tomlinson et al. (2003) found that when teachers change their instruction based on the learning needs of all students, they achieve better academic performance and, in turn, enhanced self-worth. Another factor that has come out is the application of formative assessment and constructive feedback in enhancing students' self-esteem. Leenknecht et al. (2021) described using formative assessment as enhancing students' learning and their perception of themselves. In recent years, Hattie and Timperley (2007) provided a model of feedback that focuses on comments related to the task content and process for improvement, and the model has been found to increase achievement and students' self-esteem.

Culturally, teaching has also been considered for its capacity to increase self-esteem, especially among minority students. Gay (2018) also focused on culturally responsive teaching, where students' cultural backgrounds should be included as a teaching strategy to foster positive self-attitude. Aronson and Laughter (2016) revealed that culturally responsive teaching practices positively affected academic achievement and students' self-esteem in diverse settings.

Another area in which the application of growth mindset interventions in teaching has been researched pertains to self-esteem. Yeager and Dweck (2012) work on mindset theory has been applied to practices designed to bring about the belief in the changeability of intelligence and skills. In their meta-analysis, Sisk et al. (2018) revealed that although growth mindset interventions have a small to medium effect, they favor students with higher academic risk and lower SES, which may influence their self-esteem.

In the Pakistani context, different studies have been conducted on the current topic. A job satisfaction relationship was found between secondary-level teachers' job satisfaction and self-esteem (Anwer et al., 2015). In a study by Zahid et al. (2022), teachers' perceptions were explored through classroom management and self-efficacy beliefs. Prospective teachers' self-efficacy beliefs were explored through classroom management and differentiated instruction (Iqbal & Muhammad, 2020; Saeed et al., 2022). Similarly, principals' self-efficacy beliefs were explored about managing bullying cases at the secondary school level (Siddiqui et al., 2021). Self-efficacy beliefs regarding online teaching were explored in two studies among in-service teachers (Hani et al., 2021; Naz et al., 2020). Regarding teaching, different studies have been conducted on teacher educators' reflective teaching practices exploration in a teacher training program (Saif et al., 2021). In another study, innovative teaching and technology integration were explored in terms of teachers' perspectives (Tariq et al., 2019). Secondary school teachers' perspectives were explored to teach science students to think critically (Jamil & Muhammad, 2019). Jamil, Jan, et al. (2024) conducted a study regarding pre-service teachers' perceptions of pedagogical skills learned during teacher education programs. In another study by Jamil, Urooj, et al. (2024), elementary school teachers' pedagogical content knowledge was explored. Following are the research hypotheses.

H1: Teaching strategies would affect students' self-esteem.

H2: There exists a notable correlation between the methods used for teaching and the level of self-esteem exhibited by students.

H3: There would be a notable difference in the self-esteem levels of male and female students.

3. Research Methodology

The descriptive quantitative research design was used in this study. The study population comprised public secondary school students from class 10 and teachers from the Tehsil Murree. The convenient and random sampling technique was employed in this study. The sample consisted of 300 students, 23.5% of the student population (150 males and 150 females of class 10th were selected), and 120 teachers, 64% of the total teacher population, were taken as a sample. Two instruments were used to measure study variables. The first tool was self-developed, consisting of 29 items developed on a Likert scale. The second tool was the Cooper Smith Self-Esteem Inventory (CSEI or SEI), a widely used self-report survey created by Cooper Smith (1981, 1987, 2002). This survey questionnaire is commonly used to evaluate persons in both teenage and adult populations. The CSEI questionnaire comprises 58 items, which are used to calculate both a composite score and five distinct scores that assess different aspects of self-esteem. The study includes components such as overall self-esteem, social self-esteem about peer interactions, self-esteem within the family or home environment, a lying scale used to detect response bias, and self-esteem within the school context (or work context for the adult version). Many researchers have used this scale earlier (Prastika et al., 2023). The collected data was used to enter in SPSS for data analysis purposes. For data analysis, the researchers used Regression analysis to find the effects of teaching strategies on students' self-esteem. Respondents of the study are described in the following table.

Table No 1: Gender of the Respondents

	Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)
Male	150	50%
Female	150	50%
Total	300	100%

Table 1 shows that out of the total respondents of the study, 50% of the respondents' gender were male, and 50% of respondents' gender were female.

4. Findings of the Study

Hypothesis 1: Effect of teaching strategies on students' self-esteem.

Table No 2: Regression Analysis Summary with the Prediction of Teaching Strategies on Student's Self-Esteem.

Predictors	R	R ²	Adjusted R ²	F	P
SEI	.321a	.103	.095	13.540	.000

(R² = .103, F= 13.540, p <.000)

Table No 3: Analysis of Variance for Regression Analysis with the prediction of teaching strategies on student’s self-esteem.

Predictors	Model	SS	df	MS	F	Sig.
(Constant)	Regression	3843.558	1	3843.558	36.900	.000b
SEI	Residual	33496.142	118	283.866		
	Total	37339.700	119			

Dependent Variable: Self-Esteem

Predictors: (Constant), Teaching Strategy

The above tables illustrate the variable’s model summary and the study’s major predictor among students. The R-square (.103), adjusted R² (.095), and Std. The errors in the Estimate are also included in the table. These findings indicate teaching strategies are a statistically significant predictor of self-esteem among students.

Hypothesis 2: Relationship between teaching strategies and students’ self-esteem.

Table No 4: Results of Correlation Between Variables

	M	SD	1	2
Teaching strategy	128.95	17.714	-	
SEI	70.04	14.560	.321**	-

** . “Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).”

The relationship between teaching strategy and students’ self-esteem was examined by correlation analysis. The alpha value of 0.05 was used to analyze the correlations. Every pair of variables showed significant associations at the 2-tailed 0.01 level.

Hypothesis 3: Difference between the self-esteem of male and female students.

Table No 4: Gender-based differences between teaching strategies on student’s self-esteem.

Variable	Male (N=150)		Female (N=150)		t	p	Cohen’s d
	M	SD	M	SD			
Teaching Strategy	129.9	17.77	128.0	17.75	.575	.000	3.250
SEI	68.14	13.29	71.70	15.49	-1.341	.000	2.655

The above table of independent samples t-test yielded a statistically significant result, with a significance level of 0.05. The t-value was calculated as .575, with a corresponding p-value of 0.000. Consequently, the null hypothesis was accepted, posing no gender-based difference in teaching technique and student self-esteem. This discovery implies a substantial difference in the mean between categories based on gender.

4.1 Discussion

This study examined how instructional methods affect students' self-esteem. The anticipated outcomes of this research endeavor are likely to produce substantial revelations regarding the correlation between instructional methodologies and students' self-esteem. It is expected that the implementation of student-centered and innovative teaching methods, inclusive classrooms, the delivery of constructive feedback, and the cultivation of autonomy will be linked to higher levels of self-esteem in students. The review findings suggest that teachers' self-esteem significantly impacts their educator efficacy. Moreover, the research findings indicate that students' opinions of their achievement and confidence are greatly influenced by their professors' positive and respected attitudes. The research conducted by Mbuva (2016) is expected to produce positive results for improving teachers' professional development. Prior research has demonstrated the efficacy of incorporating previous knowledge into primary and secondary teaching. Lately, this technique has been included in the broader educational system. Therefore, there is a significant global effort in educational institutions and businesses to move away from traditional lecture-based teaching approaches and towards a more engaging and advantageous educational experience facilitated by interactive activities.

This study examines the effect of agreeable learning strategies on the utilization of successful learning, the preference for agreeable learning, levels of confidence, engagement in classroom and group discussions, and academic performance among pre-service teachers. The study investigating the impact of active learning was carried out utilizing pedagogical methods. In a study conducted by Bulut (2009), correlation analysis was used to investigate the relationship between teaching technique and students' self-esteem, specifically focusing on the results of hypothesis 2. The statistical significance of the links was assessed using a significance level of 0.05. Significant correlations were observed between each pair of variables, with a statistical significance level of 0.01, using a two-tailed test. The correlation analysis reveals a robust and statistically significant association between the instructional style employed and the levels of self-esteem displayed by students. All combinations of variables exhibited statistically significant relationships at the 0.01 level, indicating a strong confidence level in the observed correlations. Correlation analysis has yielded convincing evidence demonstrating a significant and enduring connection between instructional techniques and students' self-esteem.

A two-tailed independent samples t-test reveals a statistically significant disparity in teaching style and self-esteem between male and female students. The t-statistic is a statistical metric utilized to evaluate the disparity between the means of two groups being compared, specifically regarding gender. The researcher reported t-values of 0.575 and -1.341 in the findings. The t-value is used to quantify the difference's magnitude relative to the variability observed within the individual groups. A higher t-value indicates a greater level of statistical significance in the observed difference. The findings indicate a significant discrepancy in the impact of instructional approaches on the self-esteem of male and female students. Additional examination and interpretation of the averages and magnitudes of the effects may offer a deeper understanding of the underlying characteristics of this gender-related disparity. The existing amount of scholarly

research on the correlation between academic achievement and self-esteem (Ahmadi, 2020; Luo et al., 2020; Tus, 2020) and also Ahmadi (2020) indicates that students' overall self-esteem is not affected by their academic standing despite variations in self-reported academic performance. The results suggest that people uphold their self-esteem by positively evaluating non-academic components of their self-concept and, in certain instances, by downplaying their academic ability.

5. Conclusion

The current study focused on analyzing the effect of teaching methodologies on learners' self-perception in general, social, familial, and academic settings. The results offer a valuable contribution to understanding the causal connection between the approaches to instruction and students' identity. Thus, the findings of this study confirm that teaching strategies are a statistically significant factor influencing self-esteem among students. It supports the first hypothesis and is consistent with previous literature emphasizing proper teaching methodologies and the learners' self-esteem. The result showed a significant positive relationship between the instructional method and students' self-esteem, supporting the second hypothesis. In addition, it was evidenced that gender played an important role in the correlation between teaching strategies and self-esteem. Thus, the finding supports the third hypothesis by indicating that instructional approaches may affect male and female learners' self-confidence differently.

Furthermore, the extent of the discrepancy in teaching strategy and self-esteem between males and females portrays the conclusion reached by the t-tests ($t = 0.575$ for teaching strategy and $t = -1.341$ for self-esteem). This study also established that achievement, instructional processes and approaches, and students' self-images have co-relational relationships. It was noted that although academic achievement was not directly measured in the study, teaching approaches can influence the students' perception, which determines their performance and interest in their class work.

5.1 Recommendations

- Introduction of workshops for the teachers that teach the principles of a child-oriented approach and other creative teaching methodologies to raise children's self-esteem.
- Create and apply gender-sensitive teaching methods to analyze the effects of instructions on the male and female students' self-building processes.
- It is also recommended that the evaluation of students' self-esteem be incorporated into the education process as frequently as possible to control the efficiency of the above-discussed teaching methods and approaches.
- Continue the idea of how the paradigm of group work and including a project-oriented approach led to better-perceived self-competency and perceived relatedness from the students.
- Encourage and model multicultural approaches to teaching and learning to make sure that the students of color feel appreciated and accepted in the classroom, with proper stress on boosting a positive attitude towards one's culture and identity for kids from different cultural backgrounds.

6. References

- Ahmadi, S. (2020). Academic self-esteem, academic self-efficacy and academic achievement: a path analysis. *J. Foren. Psy*, 5(155), 10.35248.
- Anwer, M., Jamil, M., Farooqi, M. T. K., Akram, M., & Mehmood, N. (2015). How does job satisfaction relate with self-esteem of teachers. *International Journal of AYER*, 4, 52-57.
- Aronson, B., & Laughter, J. (2016). The theory and practice of culturally relevant education: A synthesis of research across content areas. *Review of Educational Research*, 86(1), 163-206.
- Bulut, S. (2009). The effect of cooperative learning techniques on pre-service teachers' self-esteem, achievement and absences. *Suvremena Psihologija*, 12(1), 23-41.
- Dignath, C., & Veenman, M. V. (2021). The role of direct strategy instruction and indirect activation of self-regulated learning—Evidence from classroom observation studies. *Educational Psychology Review*, 33(2), 489-533.
- Fung, D. (2014). Promoting critical thinking through effective group work: A teaching intervention for Hong Kong primary school students. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 66, 45-62.
- Gándara, P. (2022). The impact of the education reform movement on limited English proficient students. In *The New Immigrants and American Schools* (pp. 179-204). Routledge.
- Gay, G. (2018). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. Teachers college press.
- Hani, U., Naz, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2021). Exploring in-service teachers' self-efficacy beliefs regarding online teaching: A qualitative multi-case study. *Global Educational Studies Review*, 6(2), 92-104.
- Hattie, J. (2009). The black box of tertiary assessment: An impending revolution. *Tertiary assessment & higher education student outcomes: Policy, practice & research*, 259, 275.
- Hattie, J., & Timperley, H. (2007). The power of feedback. *Review of Educational Research*, 77(1), 81-112.
- Holmes, N. G., Wieman, C. E., & Bonn, D. (2015). Teaching critical thinking. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 112(36), 11199-11204.
- Iqbal, T., & Muhammad, Y. (2020). Using differentiated instruction in inclusive schools: A qualitative analysis of prospective teachers' self-efficacy. *Journal of Inclusive Education*, 4(1), 229-257.
- Jamil, M. (2021). *An analysis of education policy and science teachers' practices for developing critical thinking skills in secondary school students, [PhD dissertation, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan]*.
- Jamil, M., Bokhari, T. B., & Ahmad, D. (2024). Evaluation of critical thinking elements: A qualitative content analysis of physics textbook grade ix. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(1), 344-350.
- Jamil, M., Bokhari, T. B., & Rafiq, M. (2024). Critical thinking skills development for 21st century: An analysis of Biology curriculum (2006). *Voyage Journal of Educational Studies*, 4(1), 127-138.

- Jamil, M., Jan, A., & Muhammad, N. (2024). Pre-service teachers' perceptions of pedagogical skills learned during teacher education program. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(1), 163-170.
- Jamil, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019). Teaching science students to think critically: Understanding secondary school teachers' practices. *Journal of Research & Reflections in Education (JRRE)*, 13(2), 260-276.
- Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., & Qureshi, N. (2021). Critical thinking skills development: Secondary school science teachers' perceptions and practices. *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research (SJESR)*, 4(2), 21-30.
- Jamil, M., Urooj, T., & Waqar, Y. (2024). Exploring elementary school teachers' pedagogical content knowledge: A quantitative study. *Pakistan Journal of Law, Analysis and Wisdom*, 3(1), 12-21.
- Koca, F. (2016). Motivation to learn and teacher-student relationship. *Journal of International Education and Leadership*, 6(2), 1-20.
- Leenknecht, M., Wijnia, L., Köhler, M., Fryer, L., Rikers, R., & Loyens, S. (2021). Formative assessment as practice: The role of students' motivation. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 46(2), 236-255.
- Loughlin, C., & Lindberg-Sand, Å. (2023). The use of lectures: effective pedagogy or seeds scattered on the wind? *Higher Education*, 85(2), 283-299.
- Luo, J., Yeung, P.-s., & Li, H. (2020). The relationship among media multitasking, academic performance and self-esteem in Chinese adolescents: The cross-lagged panel and mediation analyses. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 117, 105308.
- Mbuva, J. (2016). Exploring teachers' self-esteem and its effects on teaching, students' learning and self-esteem. *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, 16(5).
- Naz, M., Hani, U., & Muhammad, Y. (2020). Self-efficacy beliefs of pre-service teachers regarding online teaching. *International Journal of Distance Education and E-Learning*, 6(1), 47-65.
- Prastika, B. S., Wibowo, M. E., & Purwanto, E. (2023). The Effectiveness of Reality Group Counseling to Improve the Self-Esteem of Students with Low Body Image. *Jurnal Bimbingan Konseling*, 12(1), 39-44.
- Pritchett, L. (2022). Creating education systems coherent for learning outcomes.
- Rosenberg. (1965). Society and the Adolescent Self-image. *Princeton University*.
- Saeed, N., Farooq, F., & Muhammad, Y. (2022). Self-efficacy beliefs of prospective teachers regarding classroom management: Evidence from two case studies. *Journal of Education and Social Studies*, 3(2), 116-125.
- Saif, S., Muhammad, Y., & Safdar, S. (2021). Teacher educators' reflective teaching practices in a teacher training program in Lahore: A multiple case study. *International Review of Basic and Applied Sciences*, 9(3), 321-331.

- Siddiqui, M. F., Muhammad, Y., & Naseer, H. (2021). Principals' self-efficacy beliefs about managing bullying cases in secondary schools. *Sir Syed Journal of Education in Social Research*, 4(1), 338-349.
- Slavin, R. E. (2015). Cooperative learning in elementary schools. *Education 3-13*, 43(1), 5-14.
- Tariq, B., Dilawar, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019). Innovative teaching and technology integration: Exploring elderly teachers' attitudes. *International Journal of Distance Education and E-Learning*, 5(1), 1-16.
- Tomlinson, C. A., Brighton, C., Hertberg, H., Callahan, C. M., Moon, T. R., Brimijoin, K., Conover, L. A., & Reynolds, T. (2003). Differentiating instruction in response to student readiness, interest, and learning profile in academically diverse classrooms: A review of literature. *Journal for the Education of the Gifted*, 27(2-3), 119-145.
- Tulley, M., & Chiu, L. H. (1995). Student teachers and classroom discipline. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 88(3), 164-171.
- Tus, J. (2020). Self-concept, self-esteem, self-efficacy and academic performance of the senior high school students. *International Journal of Research Culture Society*, 4(10), 45-59.
- Warner, S. (2021). *It's all about self-confidence and self-esteem*. Scott Warner.
- Yeager, D. S., & Dweck, C. S. (2012). Mindsets that promote resilience: When students believe that personal characteristics can be developed. *Educational Psychologist*, 47(4), 302-314.
- Zahid, S. B., Muhammad, Y., & Waqar, Y. (2022). Becoming an effective classroom manager: Preservice teachers' perceptions of their classroom management education and self-efficacy beliefs. *Sir Syed Journal of Education in Social Research*, 5(3), 68-77.