

## Impact of Institutional Climate on Students' Learning Capabilities in Universities of Punjab

Farasat Zahra<sup>1</sup> Muhammad Dilshad (Corresponding Author)\*<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>PhD Scholar, Department of Education, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.

<sup>2</sup>\*Professor, Chairman, Department of Education, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Punjab, Pakistan.

Corresponding Author: [dilshadiub@hotmail.com](mailto:dilshadiub@hotmail.com)

**Keywords:** Institutional Effectiveness, Students' learning, Higher Education, Institutional Climate

**Article History**

Date of Submission: 01-08-2023

Date of Acceptance: 29-09-2023

Date of Publication: 30-09-2023

**DOI** <https://doi.org/10.56976/rjsi.v5i3.139>

**No:**

*The main objective of the research to find out existing institutional functioning and situation of higher education institutes was to find out and compare the perceptions of teachers and students about institutional climate and its efficiency. The study was descriptive in nature with quantitative approach. Survey method was considered appropriate for collecting the desired data for quantitative study. The tool was prepared to cover the dimensions of planning and management, institutional climate, cost effectiveness, institutional integrity in higher education institutions. While the required data obtained vi questionnaires. The study population include all the students of the higher educational institutions of the Punjab. Stratified sampling was used. The collected data was analyzed quantitatively. In quantitative analysis researcher used descriptive statistics, while t-test and correlation were used. results of the study revealed that many factors had great influence for institutional climate like planning and management, integrity of the members of the institute's environment and cost effectiveness. The study may provide criteria to track the environment and effectiveness of higher education institutions either public or private. Additionally, studies can be conducted on larger scale to maintains/model / standards for the effectiveness of the higher education institutions.*

## 1. Introduction

Education always pays off in a variety of ways since it is such a significant and profitable investment. Educational institutions that have an effective system and a willing administration that offers high-quality services consistently see an increase in the number of bright and talented students enrolling. Higher authorities at the institution should maintain awareness of students' expectations, academic preferences, and quality perceptions of the educational environment in order to make it progressive and effective (Murphy, 2017). Higher academic level students, or those enrolled in universities, are especially interested in pursuing higher quality education and system excellence because it upholds their self-worth and equips them with all the necessary skills to become successful educators (Garcia, 2016). Consequently, it is the institutional climate of a higher educational institution or university that it enables the students by assuring the persona grooming and the excellence in order to take maximum out of it for students. Climate of an institution determine the methods that an institution is employing to measure performance contrary to mission.

The term effectiveness can be defined as a continuous process of assessment and evaluation of the institutions whether those are achieving their goals. It involves throughout evaluation of programs and services and students learning procedures. An institution's atmosphere mostly depends on how each of its services and programs contributes to attaining the organization's overall objectives. According to Bers (2011) "In this era of accountability, shrinking financial resources and greater urgency for community colleges to remain flexible and responsive, program review can inform institutional leaders about what needs to be enriched, revised, improved, downsized, and eliminated". The efficacy of the institutional climate is a cyclical process that involves continuing aim and method revisions and continuous improvements. Moreover, institutional efficacy is a dynamic process that is always changing. Accordingly, it must be regularly reviewed to make sure that the goals, objectives, and mission of the college or university are being fulfilled (Guidelines for the Evaluation of Institutional Effectiveness, 2015).

This study may help to find out existing institutional functioning its climate and situation of higher education institutes it could help in decision making and to take suitable measures for enhancing the quality of higher education institutes in Punjab it brings improvement in teaching learning conditions it may increase the efficiency of the institutions moreover it acts as a source of improvement. This study is significant in number of ways as this study exhibit a holistic picture of institutes and universities of Punjab, Moreover the study is reflecting on climate of higher education institutes as it identified the strengths and shortcomings of the institutes. The results of the study supply the administrator's/ faculty personnel's, administrators of institutions with the required guidelines in general to guarantee, preserve and enhance the quality in planning management as well as educational activities. This research hopefully facilitated educational planners, faculty members and decision makers to devise a

comprehensive policy for the quality of institutions at college level. The Higher Education may also use the study's findings to create the framework required for higher education institutions to be effectively institutionalized.

Research objectives are following:

1. To explore the existing state of institutional climate, efficiency of higher education institutes at Punjab level as perceive by students.
2. To investigate the relationship of institutional climate and students learning outcome in higher education institutes in Punjab.

## **2. Literature Review**

Institutional climate is widely studied term in higher education institutions in recent times it involves all those aspects which affect the performance of students' capabilities in foster to learn. Al kurdi et al (2020) states that climate of the institution involves impartiality, innovativeness, and association. Fairness refers to an employee's insight that practices of institution are unbiased, fair and just. This motivate the stakeholder of the institution and also builds and maintain the trust among them. however Institutional effectiveness often used parallel to the latter is the term which was incorporated in the official documents by the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools Commission on Colleges (SACSCOC) in 1985. it shows the progression where outcomes and achievements show how well an institute's mission is being accomplished. Primarily the idea of the institutional effectiveness is to exhibit continuous improvement in student education its environment planning and managing staff institutional integrity and community benefits. In order to find data-based improvements to educational programs and the student learning environment throughout the institution, institutional effectiveness entails the systematic assessment of educational program outcomes and student learning capacities.

In a higher education setting, institutional climate is a nuanced concept that is challenging to quantify. The definition of effectiveness in higher education is balancing the needs of their constituents with the economic, social, and environmental forces that impact colleges and universities. The effectiveness and atmosphere of the organization are influenced by various factors. According to Abbasi and Mir (2012) resources and staff competence are significant in determining the student's capabilities. Zehui Yu (2022) further affirmed that it involves code of conduct emphasize on rules 'encouraging positive social relations among individual learners. According to Saudi (2021) There are following factors which effects the efficiency of any institution. They are planning and management, institutional safety and security, Cost effectiveness and community benefit and institutional integrity.

The institutional environment of higher education institutions in Punjab plays a crucial role in optimizing the utilization of resources and achieving educational goals with a focus on maintaining high-quality standards. By efficiently managing financial, human, and infrastructural resources. The services and quality have great impact on students' satisfaction in universities as it is a vital determinant of the overall educational

experience. Ensuring high service quality, including effective teaching, student support, and administrative processes, is integral to meeting students' needs and expectations (Mohanta et al 2023) quoted in their study that institution climate has a profound influence over students' performance and study shows a significant positive relationship among both variables. A positive relationship between service quality and student satisfaction not only enhances the reputation of these institutions but also leads to higher motivation and better academic outcomes among students (Malik et al., 2010).

The evaluation of the professional competency of university faculty members as perceived by higher education students underscores the significance of an effective teaching workforce. Students' perceptions are invaluable feedback for faculty development and institutional enhancement. Fostering professional competence among educators is crucial for providing a high-quality education, fostering student engagement, and ensuring the continued relevance and excellence of higher education institutions (Ibad & Sharjeel, 2021). Factors affecting students' learning performance through collaborative learning and engagement encompass a range of variables. These include the quality of group dynamics, the level of active participation and interaction among students, the clarity of learning objectives, the guidance and facilitation provided by instructors, and the relevance and diversity of collaborative tasks (Qureshi et al., 2023).

Abbasi et al. (2011) analyzed that students in Pakistani universities are not enough satisfied with several fundamental facilities and services, for instance teaching training, structural sustenance, resources for library, research laboratory amenities, space, medical services, and facilities for athletics. However, agreement has been documented in few areas, specifically conveyance, classroom facilities, and prayer services. Notably, there were not any substantial differences in opinions between manly and womanly responses. Overall, satisfaction level is alarmingly small, representing that university students in Pakistan are marginally satisfied regarding the provision of educational services by their campuses.

Chakraborty & Biswas, (2019) indicated that enhancing research and development efforts among faculty members significantly enhances the quality of their teaching. The availability and quality of infrastructure play a pivotal role in supporting a teacher's research and development initiatives. Additionally, the working environment has a dual impact on both teachers' research activities and their teaching proficiency. Lazić & Gazizulina, (2021) highlighted the importance of developing a quality assessment system and ranking for higher education institutions. Additionally, it is crucial to evaluate the relevance of key performance indicators from various stakeholder perspectives. However, it is possible to establish a decision support system that can aid in selecting the most effective strategy for the study programs quality enhancements.

The efficiency of the higher education in enhancing students' learning in the field of education is a multifaceted and dynamic process. While it undoubtedly equips students with essential knowledge, skills, and critical thinking abilities, its ultimate impact hinges on several factors, including the quality of instruction, the relevance of the curriculum to real-world needs, and the active engagement of students. To maximize its efficacy, higher education institutions must continually adapt and innovate, emphasizing practical application, experiential learning, and the cultivation of a lifelong passion for learning (Hackett et al., 2023). Education in universities plays a pivotal part for shaping students' learning by providing advanced knowledge, critical thinking skills, and opportunities for specialization in their chosen fields. It fosters intellectual growth, encourages independent thinking, and exposes students to diverse perspectives and ideas. Moreover, it equips them with the tools needed for research, problem-solving, and lifelong learning, preparing them for the complexities of the modern workforce and society (Cortese, 2003).

Higher education institutions climate has a profound and multifaceted impact on students' learning, equipping them with not only specialized knowledge moreover it enhances critical skills, the capacity for permanent learning. It fosters personal growth, cultural awareness, and social development, while also increasing employability and earning potential. Furthermore, higher education facilitates the cultivation of a diverse and well-rounded global citizenry, promoting innovation and progress, making it an invaluable investment in the individual and society as a whole Ismayilova & Bolander Laksov,( 2023).

Higher education serves several crucial functions in students' learning processes. It not only imparts specialized knowledge and skills but also fosters critical thinking, problem-solving, and the ability to engage with complex ideas. It encourages intellectual growth, broadens perspectives, and cultivates a lifelong commitment to learning. Moreover, higher education equips students with the tools needed to navigate a rapidly evolving job market and society. Ultimately, it empowers individuals to pursue their passions, contribute to their communities, and adapt to the challenges of the future (Doyle, 2023). climate of Higher education institutions plays a pivotal role in enhancing the learning system by equipping students with advanced knowledge, critical thinking skills, and specialized expertise in their chosen fields. It facilitates intellectual growth and promotes independent inquiry, fostering a culture of curiosity and lifelong learning. Furthermore, higher education institutions serve as hubs for innovation, research, and the dissemination of cutting-edge information, making significant contributions to the overall improvement of the learning system and preparing students for the dynamic challenges of the modern world (Khaldi et al., 2023). Higher education faces the challenge of staying relevant in a rapidly changing world, where technological advancements and evolving workforce demands require constant adaptation. Its role is to provide students with not just knowledge but also critical thinking skills, problem-solving abilities, and a passion for continuous learning,

equipping them for the challenges of a dynamic job market. Meeting these challenges is essential to ensure that higher education remains a key driver of individual and societal progress (Gaston, 2023). Higher education instills a mindset of continuous learning and adaptability, enabling students to address evolving challenges throughout their lives. While it may not eliminate all obstacles, it empowers individuals to navigate them with resilience and confidence; ultimately enhancing their ability to learn, grow, and succeed in an ever-changing world (Gallagher & Savage, 2020). The role of institutions climate in undergraduates' learning is crucial, but its efficiency can vary widely. While it offers specialized knowledge and critical thinking skills, it often grapples with issues such as affordability, accessibility, and curriculum relevance. Achieving efficiency requires institutions to adapt to changing needs, embrace technology for effective learning, and prioritize experiential education. Ultimately, the efficiency of higher education hinges on its ability to produce well-rounded, adaptable graduates ready for the complexities of the modern world (Salvador et al., 2022).

In a higher education setting, organisational effectiveness—including its planning, management, and climate—is a nuanced concept that is challenging to quantify. The definition of effectiveness in higher education is balancing the needs of their constituents with the economic, social, and environmental forces that impact colleges and universities. The effectiveness of the institution is impacted by various factors. Physical resources and staff competency are significant factors in determining students' performance, according to Abbasi and Mir (2012). They claim that these serve as venues for interactions between faculty, students, and institutional frameworks. Given the significant influence that institutional facilities have on students' academic achievement, academic institutions ought to be dedicated to and open to creating policies that support learning in their settings.

### **Research Methodology**

The objective of this study was to investigate the institutional climate and efficiency in higher education institutes of Punjab. The study was descriptive in nature. The descriptive research describes characteristics of the population or phenomenon that is being studied (Manjunatha 2019). The present study used the quantitative approach. quantitative analysis was made. The survey approach was thought to be suitable for gathering the needed data for the investigation. However, questionnaires were considered more reliable source of obtaining data. As survey research provides so many of ways to involve participants, data collection, and utility of various methods of instrumentation. Hena (2020) Survey research can use quantitative research strategies Moreover, emails and other sources was used. Present study was based on quantitative method as this design was more suitable to track the institutional climate and its effectiveness. Moreover, the data for present study was collected by questionnaires.



Study participants were students, of public and private universities. The Population was the whole while the small chunk was extracted among them as a sample of this study. Stratified sampling was used to select the sample for questionnaire for students and faculty members of higher education institutes. Students from final classes were selected. Primarily the data was collected from 1200 students from which 71 students had given inadequate data thus it was rejected. So, the final sample size 1129 with a response rate of 80%. The sample consisted of 45% boys and number 35(%) girls.

Questionnaire, for students of higher education institutes was adopted and modified and critically evaluated by experts. Furthermore, the questionnaire was comprised of 5-point Likert scale, Questionnaire which was distributed among students was validated primarily by critical means.

### 3. Results and Discussion

The prime focus of the investigation was to attain an insight of the developments, measures, and other support substructures established by higher education institutes to completely assimilate institutional performance practices and to guarantee data access and integrity for all users, internal and external (such as trustees). Data were analyzed by using statistical suite for social sciences (version 20), In the analysis researcher used graphic statistics. while t-test and correlation were used to measure the difference and relationship between variables. It provides perception of students about efficiency and climate of educational institutions.

**Table No 1: Sociodemographic Characteristics of Participants of Study (N = 1121)**

Characteristics	N	%
Gender		
Male	470	41.9
Female	651	58.1
Institution type		
Public	526	46.9
Private	595	53.1
Faculty/Teachers		
Science	378	33.7
Social Science	743	66.3

Table 1 reveals the large number of female students ( $n = 651$ , 58.1%) contributed in the research compared to male students ( $n = 470$ , 41.9%). more number of students from private sector educational institutions ( $n = 595$ , 53.1%) were participants compared to students of public sector educational institutions/universities. Furthermore, greater number of students belonging to social science discipline ( $n = 743$ , 66.3 %) were participants of the study in comparison to their counterparts rendering services in science discipline ( $n = 378$ , 33.7%).

**Table No 2: Descriptive Statistics and Correlations for Study Variables**

	Variables	<i>n</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	1	2	3	4	5
1	Institutional Climate	1121	24.17	5.13	-	.63**	.49**	.59**	.79**
2	Student Personal Development	1121	29.57	6.98		-	.71**	.77**	.88**
3	Academic Achievement	1121	17.59	4.27			-	.82**	.81**
4	Skill Development	1121	36.62	7.70				-	.88**
5	Learning Outcomes	1121	178.58	32.65					-

\* $p < .05$ . \*\* $p < .01$ .

Table 2 revealed that institutional climate has significant positive correlation with learning outcomes of students ( $r = .79, p < .01$ ). The aforementioned table also signified that institutional climate has also significant positive relationship with the subscales/factors of learning outcomes i.e., students' personal development ( $r = .63, p < .01$ ), academic achievement ( $r = .49, p < .01$ ), and skill development ( $r = .59, p < .01$ ).

**Table No 3: Regression Coefficients of Institutional Climate on Learning Outcomes Among Students**

Variable	B	B	SE
Constant	32.33		2.64
Institutional Climate	2.17***	.64	.08
$R^2$	.41		

Note. N = 1121.

\*\*\* $p < .001$ .

Table 3 shows the impact of institutional climate on learning outcomes of students in higher education institutes of Punjab. The  $R^2$  value of .41 revealed that the predictor value explained .41% variance in the outcome variable with  $F(3, 1115) = .27, p < .001$ . The findings signified that institutional climate positively predicted learning outcomes among students seeking higher education in the universities of Punjab.

#### 4.1 Discussions

A large number of studies and reports were published in the last decade regarding the growing institutional climate its effectiveness and its impact over determining learning capabilities of the individual students. These studies also indicated the lack of apprehensions towards the major facets of effective practices in higher education institutions as these reports and studies identify the deficiencies in effectiveness practices and services. The purpose of the study was to find out current institutional efficiency by gaining perception of students about current scenario in institutions of Punjab. As the results show, the higher education institutes have a greater role in producing skill manpower similarly efficacy of the institutional climate is



parameter by which excellence in learning outcomes could be gained Present study intends to help the new research to find out the ways to assess environment of the universities and institutions by considering the variables discussed in the study, further this research anticipate in catering the challenges of effectiveness in order to enhance learning outcomes of students. Current study enables the higher education institutes by providing a general criterion to meet the challenges of students learning outcomes.

The climate of an educational institution, whether it be a school, college, or university, significantly impacts the quality of education students receive. When institutions are well-organized, adequately resourced, and have effective leadership, it creates an environment conducive to student success. This includes everything from curriculum design and teaching methodologies to support services and facilities. Moreover, institutions that regularly assess and adapt their approaches to meet evolving educational needs contribute to better learning outcomes. In essence, institutional effectiveness isn't just about administrative efficiency; it directly influences the knowledge, skills, and overall development of students.

Adnan et al (2022) found in their study that students learning capabilities are very much dependent on the provision of satisfactory educational environment Higher education institution hence it plays a transformative role in students' learning by offering advanced knowledge, critical thinking skills, and personal growth opportunities. It provides a platform for in-depth exploration of subjects, encourages self-determining thought, besides this it raises critical and research abilities. Beside academics, higher education infuses vital life skills, for instance management skills, , communication and problem solving , all of which are crucial for future success. Furthermore, it exposes students to diverse perspectives and cultures, nurturing a global perspective. Ultimately, higher education equips students possessing the knowledge and expertise required to successfully negotiate the challenges of the contemporary world and contribute significantly to society (Sousa-Vieira et al., 2023). however, the results portray a significant impact on the learning outcomes of students in universities.

#### **4. Conclusion**

Consequently, Study provides various significant measures to determine factors contributing in effectiveness institution climate of institutions earlier discussed in literature review such as planning and management institutional infrastructure, integrity, cost effectiveness of the organization. Hence results shows it gives direction to both the sectors either public or private institute similarly it gives insight to assess and achieve the learning outcomes respectively. Thus the finding of the study informs about the perceptions of students and teachers significantly differs in various indicators and in some cases concerns are common so in this regard there is need to bring reforms in many areas of higher education institutional climate .consequently study finding helps institutions of higher standard to encounter the challenges and also preserve their

values. It further provides insight about the indicators of both internal and external assessment of performance of the effectiveness and learning dimensions.

### 5.1 Implications

Institutional climate is the prime concern of educational institutions and universities. The results of the research propose that institutions that maintain effective climate of institutions are likely to have significant impact over student learning capabilities. Administrators of the institutes can use this information to upgrade the planning and management integrity and innovation to the higher education level which would help to improve over all institutions of higher education.

### Reference

- Abbasi, A. R., & Mir, G. M. (2012). Impact of teacher's ability, students' work ethics and institutional environment on student performance at university of Gujrat. *Middle-East Journal of scientific Research*, 2(4), 572-579.
- Abbasi, M. N., Malik, A., Chaudhry, I. S., & Imdadullah, M. (2011). A study on student satisfaction in Pakistani universities: The case of bahauddin Zakariya university, Pakistan. *Asian Social Science*, 7(7), 17-32. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v7n7p209>
- Adan, M. Ansari, A. M., and Yasmeen, B. (2022). The Effects of Institutional Environment on Academic Performance at Higher Level of Learning: A Case Study of Punjab University Lahore. *Bulletin of Business and Economics*, 11(1), 104-112. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.6381439>
- Al-Saadi, K. K. M. (2021). Knowledge Management Processes and their role in Career Creativity "Applied research in the Iraqi Ministry of Trade-State Company for Foodstuff Trade." *Indian Journal of Economics and Business*, 20(4), 55-70.
- Alshawabkeh, R., Rumman, A. A., Al-Abbadi, L., & Abu-Rumman, A. (2020). The intervening role of ambidexterity in the knowledge management project success connection. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 18(3), 56-69.
- Benware, C., & Deci, E. (1984). Quality of learning with an active versus passive motivational set. *American Educational Research Journal*, 21(2), 755-765. <http://dx.doi.org/10.3102/00028312021004755>
- Chakraborty, D., & Biswas, W. (2019). Motivating factors in a teacher's research and developmental activities and their impact on effective quality teaching in higher education institutions. *Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education*, 12(4), 609–632. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jarhe-07-2018-0161>
- Cortese, A. D. (2003). The critical role of higher education in creating a sustainable future. *Planning for Higher Education*, 31, 15–22.
- Doyle, T. (2023). *Helping students learn in a learner-centered environment: A guide to facilitating learning in higher education*. Taylor & Francis.
- Engin-Demir, C. (2009). Factors influencing the academic achievements of the Turkish urban poor. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 29(1), 17-29. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2008.03.003>



- Gainen, J. (1995). Barriers to success in quantitative gate keeper courses. In J. Gainen, & E. W. Williamson (Eds.), *Forstering student in quantitative gateway courses* (pp. 5-14). San Francisco: Jossey Bass
- Gallagher, S. E., & Savage, T. (2020). Challenge-based learning in higher education: an exploratory literature review. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2020.1863354>
- Gaston, P. L. (2023). *The challenge of Bologna: What United States higher education has to learn from Europe, and why it matters that we learn it*. Taylor & Francis.
- Gharieb, M. (2021). Critical Appraisal Study of Knowledge Management and its Importance Among Public Sector. *International Journal of Computer Science & Network Security*, 21(7), 273–283.
- Hackett, S., Janssen, J., Beach, P., Perreault, M., Beelen, J., & van Tartwijk, J. (2023). The effectiveness of Collaborative Online International Learning (COIL) on intercultural competence development in higher education. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education*, 20(1), 5. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-022-00373-3>
- Ibad, F., & Sharjeel, M. Y. (2021). Evaluation of the professional competency of university faculty members as perceived by higher education students. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.22555/joeed.v8i1.372>
- Ismayilova, K., & Bolander Laksov, K. (2023). Teaching creatively in higher education: The roles of personal attributes and environment. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 67(4), 536–548. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00313831.2022.2042732>
- Khalidi, A., Bouzidi, R., & Nader, F. (2023). Gamification of e-learning in higher education: a systematic literature review. *Smart Learning Environments*, 10, 25-39.
- Lau, L. K. (2003). Institutional factors affecting students' retention. *Education*, 124(1), 126-136.
- Lazić, Z., Đorđević, A., & Gazizulina, A. (2021). Improvement of quality of higher education institutions as a basis for improvement of quality of life. *Sustainability*, 13(8), 4149.
- Malik, M. E., Danish, R. Q., & Usman, A. (2010). The impact of service quality on students' satisfaction in higher education institutes of Punjab. *Journal of Management Research*, 2(2), 1–11.
- Qureshi, M. A., Khaskheli, A., Qureshi, J. A., Raza, S. A., & Yousufi, S. Q. (2023). Factors affecting students' learning performance through collaborative learning and engagement. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 31(4), 2371–2391. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2021.1884886>
- Ramsay ME, et al. The elimination of indigenous measles transmission in England and Wales. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases*. 2003;187(Suppl 1):S198–207. doi: 10.1086/368024.



- Rasheed, M. I., Aslam, H. D., & Sarwar, S. (2010). Motivational issues for teachers in higher education: A critical case of IUB. *Journal of Management Research*, 2(2), 75-93. <https://doi.org/10.5296/jmr.v2i2.349>
- Rashid, K., & Mukhtar, S. (2012). Education in Pakistan: Problems and their solutions. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 2, 45-66.
- Salvador, R., Barros, M. V., Barreto, B., Pontes, J., Yoshino, R. T., Piekarski, C. M., & de Francisco, A. C. (2022). Challenges and opportunities for problem-based learning in higher education: Lessons from a cross-program industry 4.0 case. *Industry and Higher Education*, 095042222211003. <https://doi.org/10.1177/09504222221100343>
- Tomlinson, M. (2008). The degree is not enough': students' perceptions of the role of higher education credentials for graduate work and employability. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 29(1), 49–61. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01425690701737457>
- Trigwell, K., Prosser, M., & Waterhouse, F. (1999). Relations between Teachers' approaches to teaching and students' approaches to learning. *Higher Education*, 37(1), 57-70. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1003548313194>